

PART V

**MUSICAL RE-PRESENTATIONS OF
VISUAL AND VERBAL WORKS OF ART**

Depiction and Reference

Inherent or Acquired Signification in Musical Devices

One way of pondering the ability of music to transmedialize works of poetry and painting is to arrange the devices a composer chooses in a single work of ekphrastic art on an imagined scale between, at the one end, the mimetic or concrete and, at the other, the referential or abstract. C.M.T. Loeffler's symphonic rendering of Maeterlinck's play, *La mort de Tintagiles*, and Ottorino Respighi's instrumental interpretation of Botticelli's three paintings—the two compositions with which I opened my explorations of transformations “from word to sound” and “from image to sound” respectively—are cases in point.

Both composers use the entire spectrum of depictive measures available to the musical language. There are moments in Loeffler's work that come very close to onomatopoeia, yet all-too-obvious programmatic painting is wisely eschewed. When the handmaidens of the Evil Queen approach the chamber in which the young boy, whom they are instructed to abduct, is protected by his powerless sisters, the music identifies the nature of the advancing force very clearly: a combination of characteristic drum rolls and march-like trumpet signals, accompanied by percussive rumbling and tremolo pedals in the low strings, is almost pictorially suggestive of the advent of a military conqueror. These are sounds that are not merely established in our repertoire as topically implying a powerful, self-assured aggressor. They are (or were until the advent of technological warfare) the sounds actually *heard in reality* on such occasions. By contrast, where a stage production of Maeterlinck's drama might accompany the closing thump of the door that moved without a visible mover with an appropriately haunting sound, Loeffler resists the temptation of employing what has since become a staple of film music and focuses in his music instead on the inner response experienced by the mesmerized siblings.

A little later in the music, a case of visual-conceptual reference occurs when the narrowness in the pitch range of the cantilena that epitomizes the boy and his sister suggests itself as Loeffler's mimetic depiction of the constriction that threaten to smother the young siblings' lives.

We are yet one step further from iconic resemblance when a composer takes recourse to a kind of musical painting that communicates its contents to a listener by evoking a likeness suggested by a concept used with similar implications in both media. Loeffler's principal theme with its two complements is conceived in such a way that, were listeners to associate words with the musical gestures and colors, terms like "powerful," "raw force," and "stagnant" could be expected to come to mind. Members of an audience seeing a performance of Maeterlinck's marionette play might use the same or similar terms were they to describe the somber castle with its eerie tower, inhabited by the Evil Queen who kills her offspring. In the Symbolist drama as in the music, these qualities are not named or painted blatantly but conveyed indirectly. Loeffler conveys the horror exuding from the castle and its main inhabitant by means of musical material that sounds powerful, assertive, and deadly frightening although—or perhaps because—it is locked into an ever-similar behavior, a pattern in which details change but an oppressive repetitiveness persists. The same inevitability of fate, the same overall powerlessness and doom are conveyed in the drama.

The most obvious case of musical representation by reference in Loeffler's music is his use of the viola d'amore as Tintagiles's sonic signifier. There is nothing in the protagonist as Maeterlinck describes him that would suggest a self-evident connection between the threatened little boy and this instrument; and yet, as soon as the link is established—which happens, for the listener not familiar with the clues in the composer's correspondence, exclusively through musical eloquence and without any assistance of non-musical means—it assumes the unmediated power otherwise reserved for visual or verbal portrayal. This in turn allows the composer to end the piece with a relatively "explicit" portrayal of a spiritual perspective. The lingering sound of the viola d'amore, outliving all other instruments, draws the listeners' attention into the dying boy's inner experience rather than focusing on his death as perceived from the outside, as verbal representation almost necessarily has it.

Similarly in the case of the musical rendering of a work of visual art, Respighi uses an (extant or convincingly imitated) Renaissance dance to make us hear the music to which the three Graces in Botticelli's *Primavera* sway. When the composer colors the refrain of the troubadour song with harmonics in the violins, he relies on our visual-conceptual comprehension of this musical device as a representation of loftiness; we are invited to understand that he is pointing to the "elevated" nature of the

love to which the Florentine artist dedicated his painting about Venus. Finally, the way in which Respighi plays with tonality to evoke different realms of reality in the third movement of his *Trittico botticelliano*, is a case of context-dependent referentiality.

The Listener's Contribution

The significance of the listener's familiarity with the primary work of art increases in proportion with the degree to which a composer establishes original links between musical means and extra-musical contents. Musical gestures of military prowess or narrowness convey distinct pictures of triumphant, potentially threatening force and (physical or emotional) constraint respectively, whether or not an audience is equipped to associate fictional characters with the agents in the suggested scenarios. By contrast, a harmonic is just an overtone, and a viola d'amore nothing but an instrument rarely heard in a symphony orchestra. Without the mental picture of a little boy who dies, defeated and frightened, the ending of Loeffler's composition strikes an audience as merely strange; some find it eerily beautiful, others describe it as slightly troubling, but it is almost impossible for an uninitiated audience to experience the redeeming quality the unusual closure acquires in light of the dramatic plot. A harmonics-inflected tune from the troubadour repertoire may be assumed to signify elevated love whether or not a listener identifies the genre and retraces the connection to idealized adoration. However, it requires familiarity with the painting being referred to, as well as knowledge of the general humanistic ideas informing depictions of mythological contents in the era of Neoplatonism, if an audience is to follow Respighi as he represents, through this symbolic attribute, Venus the goddess of divine love as painted by Botticelli.

The Object of Musical Representation: Form and Content

Intersecting with such an imagined scale from the mimetic to the referential is another plane to be pondered, one defined by the nature of what is being transmedialized. Composers may wish to represent in their music not only a content imagined as a scene or story, but beyond that the artistic language in which this content was first expressed, its form as well as stylistic or otherwise idiosyncratic details of the primary depiction.

If this is their aim, they may choose any of the devices on the above-mentioned spectrum, from means of mimetic depiction to those based on conceptual reference.

This second plane can again be perceived as graded, this time along lines defined by different admixtures of form and content. Music can take as its point of departure the medium employed in the original representation. A composer may attempt to reconstruct, and at the same time enrich, French lyrical prose by recasting it in the form of an orchestral recitation (as Hindemith did in his *Hérodiade*). A composer may aim to capture the multiple fragments in identical or similar hues by which stained-glass windows are distinguished from other visual representations, stringing together “shards” of music by way of multiple repetition, including even an emulation of the variations in color owing to thinning intensity close to the edges; all this and more can be ascertained in Gilboa’s *The Twelve Jerusalem Chagall Windows*. Turning to cases where a medium becomes part of the content, a composer may draw his or her influence from the substance alluded to within the primary representation and thus (as does McCabe in several of his *Chagall Windows*) create musical images of water or (like Carter in his *Concerto for Orchestra*) recreate the four “voices” in which Perse’s poem speaks in the form of four orchestral sound groups.

A musical transformation can tangibly point to the time into which a scene or story is placed, be it that of Saint Francis of Assisi’s twelfth century (through the use of a *trouvère* song from the era, as heard in Hindemith’s *Nobilissima Visione*) or that of the modernity of twentieth-century technology, which informs “twittering machines” and the likes (through the use of dodecaphonic pitch organization in Schuller’s composition or of motoric uniformity in Klebe’s). Music can translate an implied image, as Davies did when he organized some of the basic musical entities in his “Twittering Machine” in a precisely overlapping fashion that imitates the—invisible but no doubt necessary—cogwheels in Klee’s contraption. Or it can focus on a developmental aspect not portrayed but implicit in the primary representation, as Gilboa did when he translated Chagall’s depiction of Gad’s life of aggression into a very dynamic musical entity of ever more relentless attacks, repeated at ever shorter intervals.

A composer can create reference in the context of a single composition, as is often the case with the symbolic use of specific instruments, colors, or rhythmic gestures and their capacity to “represent.” Or he can

invite the listener to draw from a shared pool of pre-existing musical referents, through the citation of extant musical material—see Respighi quoting Vivaldi to refer to “spring,” Martinů recreating the cross-related chord sequence prefigured in Suk’s *Asrael* and Dvořák’s *Rusalka* when evoking death, or Respighi suggesting the orchestral palette of Rimsky-Korsakov’s *Shéhérazade* to place his representation as an event occurring in the Orient. At the very other end of the spectrum, a composer may replace an already abstract concept with one of the qualities commonly associated with it and then express only this (now detached) quality in the music, as Schoenberg did, whose interpretation of “fate” in *Pelleas und Melisande* seems to rely on the conviction that life’s quandaries, just as some inverted dominant-seventh chords, do not resolve as they are anticipated to do.

Last but not least, as the fortuitous cases of several composers responding to the same work of art demonstrate, the range of possible approaches is open not only with regard to the question *how* something will be re-presented or re-told, but just as much by the choice of *what* is chosen to be musically transposed. While Loeffler employs thematic material to embody Maeterlinck’s characters, Martinů’s motifs and textures stand for the abstract forces at play in the drama. While Davies and Schuller focus on the joint fate of the four pathetic bird heads attached to Klee’s crank, albeit allowing for very different degrees of rebellion versus helpless compliance, Klebe sees four individuals taking very different stands under shared duress. And while Gilboa feels inspired by a combination of the words heard in Jacob’s blessing and the radiant, translucent play of light through glass seen in Chagall’s windows, McCabe concerns himself with the dynamics prevailing among the twelve brothers and tribal ancestors as both the biblical patriarch and the artist presented them.

Means of Musical Transmedialization

As the exploration of case studies has shown, there is no parameter of the musical language that has not been used in the service of depicting or referring to an extra-musical reality in general and, more specifically, an extra-musical work of art with its form and contents. At best, certain preferences can be observed in the means chosen by a certain composer.

Rhythmic Signifiers

Musical signification achieved by means of rhythmic features has traditionally received less attention than that created with pitches and the horizontal or vertical entities they help to build. And yet, almost all facets of rhythmic structuring have at one time or another been employed to convey affect. Schoenberg's double-dotted attack for his "fate" motif in *Pelleas und Melisande* and his play, in the same piece, with syncopations to capture ambivalence are perhaps the most easily memorable examples. Similarly, in the basic, "Life"-epitomizing component of Martinů's work, *La mort de Tintagiles*, which is distinguished by its uncommon wealth of variation in all parameters, the rhythmic shape with its repeated dotted-note group followed by a two-note ascent to a beat-two syncopation is the only reliable component to continue throughout the composition.

Segments defined by certain overall rhythmic features may communicate their message on a subconscious level. Rhythmic flexibility is often employed to epitomize the concept of freedom, especially the freedom from the constraints of conventions. By extension, rhythmic flexibility may stand for a cliché characterization of a cultural other—be it the King from the Orient at the beginning of Respighi's "Adorazione dei Magi" or the faun in Debussy's composition on Mallarmé: both are musically represented in rhythmically very elastic woodwind melodies. By contrast, rhythmic monotony evokes different associations depending on the context in which it is heard. In connection with extended note repetition and percussive sounds, a listener will hear monotony as combative energy (as in the "Judah" of McCabe's *Chagall Windows*). In a largely homophonic setting, one is reminded of machine-generated noises (this plays into the

first movement of Klebe's *Zwitschermaschine*.) In the unusual case that a pervasive rhythmic monotony effectively cancels out the effect of another feature of the composition, as is the case in the sixteen-part polyphony of the fugato section in Martinů's *Mort de Tintagiles*, I have interpreted such hectic but apparently ineffective squirming as a musical equivalent to the effect created in the multiple images of "dance of death" depictions with ever new clients suffering the never-changing fate.

Polyrhythm is another aspect of the play with durations. McCabe uses this device to great effect already in the first section of his composition, where he depicts Reuben, whom his father Jacob had called "unstable as water," in rhythms organized on the basis of three simultaneously sounding but non-compatible values and further spiced with syncopations.

Beyond the interplay of the durations of single notes, rhythm also applies, of course, to larger entities. In his transmedialization of Perse's four-section poem, *Vents*, Carter has devised a technique whereby the four "movements" of his *Concerto for Orchestra* dive in and out of the listeners' attention, in what he called "an oscillating, wavelike fading in and out of different sonorities and characters." The points of emergence of each of the four strands of harmonic and timbral material are timed in the manner of a large-scale polyrhythm. Each level is spaced in perfect regularity with regard to duration in performance, with the result that the intricately overlapping whole creates the impression of an order that originates quite beyond human comprehension.

Pitches, Intervals, and Contours

Pitches, the smallest units of diastematic material, are used as signifiers both individually and collectively: Debussy in his *Prélude à l'après-midi d'un faune* employs two pitches as tonal centers to represent the two competing aspects in the faun's perception of what happened to him. Contrary to Debussy, whose C# and E generally function as units in their own right without implying any chord that can be erected on them, Schoenberg groups his musical material in *Verklärte Nacht* around the major and minor triads built over D and its two adjacent semitones. And Schuller in the "Twittering Machine" from his *Seven Studies on Themes by Paul Klee* uses a pitch collection—a twelve-tone row—to refer to the abstract, modernist-mechanical nature of the music emitted by the bird heads in Klee's twittering machine.

The connection of two or more pitches into intervals or chains thereof plays a role in both works by Schoenberg investigated in this study. Drawing on the signification of certain intervals established in the context of the rhetorics-of-music tradition, he employs tritones and semitones (in the material characterizing the women in *Verklärte Nacht* and *Pelleas und Melisande*) versus perfect fourths and fifths (for “the man” as described in Dehmel’s poem and the brothers, particularly Golaud in Maeterlinck’s drama) to distinguish emotional insecurity from self-assurance: the *diabolus in musica* stands for the not-quite-accepted, while the “perfect” intervals, as emblems of consonance, express conformity with conventional views. The intervallic structure in both compositions allows to establish a clear link between triadic progressions and certainty on the one hand, chromaticism and distress on the other.

In a dodecaphonic context, Carter distinguishes the four narrative strands in Perse’s *Vents* (the winds, men, human limitations, and America) through different degrees of consonance in his four “voices”: the third voice shows by far the highest degree of dissonance in its tonal vocabulary with one five-note cluster, three four-note, and five three-note clusters, while the fourth voice with only one cluster altogether is the most consonant.

Finally for the use of pitches and their combinations, Schoenberg takes the lead when it comes to the musical representation of abstract qualities by means of harmonic progressions. His depiction of fate in *Pelleas und Melisande* through improperly resolving dominant-ninth chords in has already been mentioned. The corresponding feature in *Verklärte Nacht* is his unstable ninth-chord in fourth inversion with its “improper” solution, which he uses to refer to the woman’s “improper” resolution in connection with her pregnancy.

Pitches joined to form recurring motifs may assume signifying power either through the associations composers and audiences share about the message implicit in certain contours, or through context-inherent relationships. Loeffler’s *Mort de Tintagiles* and McCabe’s *Chagall Windows* provide particularly convincing examples for the former, while the derivation of the woman’s motifs from her “source phrase” in Schoenberg’s *Verklärte Nacht* is a model for narrative coherence created on the basis of musical interconnections. The three fourth-level motifs in his *Pelleas und Melisande*, which combine features from two different signature motifs into a new message, demonstrate another kind of meaning-creating process. The inordinately large number of variations undergone in all

parameters by the “Life” motif in Martinů’s *Mort de Tintagiles* speaks eloquently of the infinite facets of what constitutes life, a variety even more striking when regarded in comparison to the small degree of modification that occurs to the motif he devised to symbolize “Death.”

Where, by contrast, a motif that has been firmly established in its original contour and the extra-musical agent it signifies recurs later in alterations arrived at through processes that in themselves imply distinct meanings, the details of the resulting shapes may communicate inflections with regard to the emotional or spiritual state of the entity referred to. This is superbly born out in Hindemith’s *Nobilissima Visione*, where the composer invites his listeners to follow Saint Francis’s psychological and spiritual experiences in the musical form of the transformations to which he subjects the trouvère song.

Timbres, Conventional and Circumstantial

Next to rhythms and pitches, the timbres of the various instruments lend themselves particularly well to characterizations of suggested *dramatis personae*. The link between a certain sound color and a human agent to be imagined may be based on conventional or otherwise established attributes or introduced in a composition to suggest traits not necessarily anticipated by the audience. In the first category we find the faun’s flute (Debussy), the horn of the huntsman (Schoenberg’s Golaud), and the military drum (McCabe’s “Benjamin.”) Bells of various kinds, including the glockenspiel, are similarly self-explanatory and have been used in this sense as sounds connected with religious rituals; see McCabe’s sections for Levi the priest, Dan the divinely designated judge, Issachar the Torah scholar, and Joseph the chosen man of God’s wisdom. (Gilboa reserves this color exclusively for Joseph and thus creates an even stronger effect.) The organ as the prototypical instrument of church ceremony is linked to the service of God. In *La danse des morts*, Honegger uses the instrument sparingly, reserving it cautiously for moments when he intends to make tangible the loving Father communicating with His children. The other aspect of God, the terrible Yahweh who appears to frightened humans in fire or thunder, the judge of human failure and weakness, is timbrally represented by the trombone. Loeffler chooses the same instrument for a related but even more eerie portrayal when he uses trombones to suggest the apparently non-human force that opens the heavy iron door in Maeterlinck’s *Tintagiles* drama.

Other instrumental colors, while not necessarily topically defined, nevertheless serve as an immediately comprehensible timbral vocabulary. This applies to the sounds of the trumpet for the dashing young fellow (Schoenberg thus introduces his Pelleas) and of the whip for brutal disposition (thus used by McCabe for his portrayal of the aggressive Gad). The bassoon, an instrument that is easily associated with charming humor and bucolic playfulness, offers itself as a very appropriate signifier in Respighi's musical response to Botticelli's painting of spring. The English horn among the wind instruments and the viola among the strings have often been called closest in color to the human voice, capturing both its range and some of the vulnerability expressed in it. When Schoenberg chooses the English horn as Melisande's instrument and Loeffler decides to represent the boy Tintagiles and his sister Ygraine by *viole d'amore*, the two composers draw on the same associations in their listeners. Strings in general, especially in full quartet or larger ensemble, have a long history of communicating human warmth and caring. In just this sense, Hindemith uses the string-quartet color for Hérodiade's nurse and, by extension, for the few moments when the princess transcends her self-centeredness to focus her attention on her affectionate attendant. Similarly, Schoenberg employs the string timbre in *Pelleas und Melisande* both for the actual "love" motif and for all transformations of the three protagonists' signature motifs that evolve under the influence of love.

A special effect obtained on string instruments, harmonics, projects the feeling of love into a higher sphere, as it were. McCabe uses this device only once, namely to evoke the pious Issachar's great love of God as expressed in his wish to live a modest life without great ambitions and instead dedicate himself to the study of the Torah. Respighi chooses the same color to refer to the idealized love epitomized by Venus.

Yet other instruments assume signifying power only in contrast to an instrument that the listener may have been led to anticipate. When Hérodiade, whom we have encountered as a high-strung soprano timbrally embodied by flute and oboe, suddenly engages in the two-octave leaps and plunges so easily available to the clarinet but highly unusual in other woodwind instruments, the listener is invited to comprehend that she is out of her mind—as close to madness as Mallarmé presented her in the mirror monologue of his "Scène d'Hérodiade." And if, in a composition where bell sounds are firmly established as emblems of holy endeavors, Naphtali is portrayed with the aid of Japanese wind chimes, we can read

this as McCabe's subtle reminder that this son of Jacob was favored without any doing of his own, an instrument made to chime without any effort, by the generosity of the passing breeze.

Structural and Textural Means

When rhythms, pitch contours, and timbres are woven into horizontal and vertical fabrics, we distinguish musical structures and textures. When these are employed to convey extra-musical meaning, they usually constitute not manifestations of pre-established genres but idiosyncratic patterns devised for the occasion.

Frequently, structural and textural means of signification relate to the primary artistic expression by emulating, or creating correspondence with, features created in the first medium. For structure, this is the case in Schoenberg's *Verklärte Nacht*; for texture, we can find it in Carter's *Concerto for Orchestra*. Just as Dehmel integrates an echo of the woman's somewhat awkward, repetitive line beginnings into the much more articulate speech characteristic of the man, so Schoenberg incorporates two of the motifs he introduces in the musical section relating to "the woman's speech" into the section that refers to the man's response. In both Dehmel and Schoenberg, this conspicuous, analogous echoing of elements known to belong to the female lover functions as a rhetorical means to express the man's sympathy with the woman's situation. More indirectly, the composer also creates an analogy to the framing device the poet employs in *Verklärte Nacht*. As I have shown in some detail, Dehmel's decision to envelop the two lovers by the narrator's continuing observation has prompted Schoenberg to think of musical means of suggesting enclosure. Yet while Dehmel's almost identical lines, beginning with the momentous "Zwei Menschen," holds the woman and the man in a joint embrace, Schoenberg splits the framing idea and allots one frame each to his protagonists. The woman's source phrase, introduced shortly after the beginning of her section and portraying all her insecurities and doubts, is taken up prominently at the conclusion of her section. Correspondingly, the man's principal motif, harmonically and melodically indicative of his serene and spiritually free nature, marks both the beginning and the end of his section. The very fact that Schoenberg designs a perceptibly corresponding feature and then deviates from the pattern he supposedly imitates in a significant way provides an excellent example for the means of subtle re-interpretation open to a transmedializing

composer. Schoenberg, contrary to Dehmel, apparently sees the two protagonists acting within different frames (of mind, convention, courage, etc.).

Similarly, Carter recreates in the “movements” of his *Concerto for Orchestra*, which are above all texturally determined, the overlapping strands in Perse’s poem. His musical introduction and coda, too, correspond quite literally to the framing cantos in the poem. Even the twelve-tone chord has a poetic counterpart. In the music, the chord is conspicuously employed in the composition’s opening and closing segments, which both texturally and tonally represents a synopsis of all that will develop or has emerged within the *Concerto*. Perse’s introduction and coda feature the image of the Cosmic Tree which, in its all-encompassing nature, endowed with shamanic powers, is symbolic of the cycles of death and rebirth. As in Schoenberg, these musical devices correspond with the literary ones; they do not refer to or depict.

In Hindemith’s *Hérodiade*, textural devices are made to speak in an intuitively comprehensible interpretation of Mallarmé’s poem; they explore facets that the poet implies through contents but does not make explicit in his form. Examples for this use of musical texture include the representation of sentences heavy with the princess’s precarious solitude in musical unison, the textural separation and repeated insertion of exclamations the composer imagined to resound in Hérodiade’s mind for longer than the literary form allowed them to be heard, and the use of polyphonic settings, particularly imitation in canon, as a concretization of the fact that she identifies with “her old lions.”

Allusions and Quotations

Finally in terms of means that offer themselves for the musical presentation of extra-musical content in general and the transmedialization of works of art in particular, all musical parameters mentioned above may be used as quotations of extant material or allusions to known genres, circumstances, or other meaning-carrying contents.

Pictorial allusions can be as generic as the hunting call Schoenberg employs to characterize Golaud in *Pelleas und Melisande*, and the orientalizing features already mentioned in the “Adoration of the Magi” of Respighi’s *Trittico botticelliano*. Allusions of a referential kind are somewhat more complex in that they commonly employ more than one parameter to create the connection to the content at which a composer

wishes to point. A fine example is also found in the second movement in Respighi's work, when the composer suggests the topos of a dirge or elegy through the combination of the siciliano rhythm with the mournful color of a slow and legato-playing bassoon and recreates in his melopoeia the impression given by the chants of the oriental liturgy.

On the borderline between allusion and quotation are those cases where a composer recalls a harmony and that which it signifies, without replicating features of rhythm and pitch contour. As I have shown with regard to Martinů's *Mort de Tintagiles*, distinct harmonies—in this case, specific cross-related triads—may have the power to refer to like ones in familiar repertoire and thus assume the contextual significance for which they have been established there. Thus the young Czech composer communicated with his audience about Death by creating a signature motif reminiscent of the Death motifs from the works of two of his compatriots, namely from Dvořák's *Rusalka* and Suk's *Asrael*. Again in Respighi, the rhythmic and metric organization of some of his material in the way familiar from Renaissance dances is certainly an allusion; it may even be a quotation (from a source not generally available to researchers). Even closer to quotation comes the chorale Honegger uses as a recurring theme in *La danse des morts*. It sounds so tantalizingly like a hymn that "must exist" that this researcher, for one, spent weeks trying to discover a source that, alas, does not seem to exist.

Quotations may be anything from subtle to conspicuous. Most characteristically, they involve themes and motifs, with or without specific textures and timbres. With few exceptions, they cite from one of three sources: another composer's composition, the folk repertoire of either the composer or the country into which the story is placed, and sacred music with its hymns and chants.

Easiest to identify among the musical quotations found in the works investigated in this study are Respighi's two borrowings, in the first and third movements of his composition, of conspicuous figures from the first concerto, entitled *Primavera*, of Vivaldi's *Le quattro stagioni*. Strictly speaking, these are paraphrases, but the identical key and octave range together with the emulation of the original timbre and ornamentation captures the atmosphere so well that the effect is one of having heard a bit of Vivaldi. Equally accessible is the quotation, in Honegger's oratorio, of the "Dies irae," which is superimposed over the remaining strands of the texture as a *cantus firmus* and thus gives listeners ample time for identification. But while no ardent music lover will miss the well-known

plain-chant or the snippets from the much-beloved violin concerto, and hardly anyone will fail to make the connection implied in the words or the title respectively, the same cannot be taken for granted in the case of Respighi's quotation, in the second movement of his *Trittico botticelliano*, of the late-Gregorian hymn, "Veni veni Emmanuel." This is a hint for the initiated.

Hindemith (in *Nobilissima Visione* after Giotto) and Respighi (in "Primavera" after Botticelli) each quote a troubadour song. Both songs are famous examples within their genre, but not for that necessarily familiar to a general concert audience. And yet, notwithstanding the obstacle that lies in the discrepancy between a composer's intention and his listeners' lacuna in "literacy," quotations such as these *can* be interpreted by a thoughtful music appreciator and, in the context of the works into which they are imported, gain very specific signifying power. As representatives of their genre, they express the trope of idealized love for an inaccessible lady—Venus herself in the one case, the Virgin Mary in the other. Respighi's "A l'entradre del tens clar" is, by virtue of its opening words, a hymn to spring and thus doubles as a musical signifier pointing to the painting to which the music refers. The real difference in the use of the quotations of similar material lies in the question who is pictured as singing. In *Trittico botticelliano*, no singer emitting the song is suggested. The quotation thus serves exclusively to point to the main character of the depiction and the assumed gist of the message intended by the artist: the representation of a personification of ideal love. By contrast in Hindemith's Giotto-inspired ballet, the trouvère song serves as the signature tune of Saint Francis and thus characterizes not the addressee of the song but him, the protagonist of the story.

With the Italian Christmas tune Respighi integrates into his musical recreation of Botticelli's *Adorazione dei Magi*, the problem of recognition arises owing to the international nature of today's concert life: Italian music audiences, I have been assured, find no difficulty whatsoever in associating the words, and thus the appropriate context, with the tune of "Tu scendi dalle stelle" (You descend from the stars). And even non-Frenchmen may be familiar with one or the other of the French folk and revolutionary songs Honegger quotes in *La danse des morts*.